



ERA Architects Inc.
#600-625 Church St
Toronto ON, M4Y 2G1

April 21, 2021

Sent by EMAIL

Mark Bryan, MCIP, RPP
Senior Planner
Town of Collingwood
P.O. Box 157
Collingwood, ON L9Y 3Z5
T: 705-445-1290 ext. 3242
E: mbryan@collingwood.ca

RE: 31 HURON STREET
 (ERA PROJECT NO. 20-301-01)

Dear Mr. Bryan,

Thank you for the opportunity to assist the Town of Collingwood by providing a peer review of the Heritage Impact Assessment ("HIA") report prepared by Golder Associates Ltd., for the application at 31 Huron Street. The following documents were reviewed as part of this process:

Golder Associates Ltd.

Heritage Impact Assessment, 31 Huron Street, Town of Collingwood, Simcoe County, Ontario; dated November 11, 2020

Additional Reference Materials

Collingwood Downtown Heritage Conservation District Plan, 2008

Town of Collingwood Official Plan, 2019

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, 2010

In addition to reviewing the HIA report, Michael McClelland and Julie Tyndorf of ERA Architects Inc. attended two virtual meetings: one with municipal staff and Cal Brook of Brook McIlroy, and the second with municipal staff, the Town's outside consultants conducting peer reviews of the application, and the applicant.

At the second meeting, the applicant suggested a possible third, separate meeting with the peer reviewers; to date, a third meeting has not occurred. An in-person site visit was not possible due to the Province's current COVID-19 restrictions.

The Golder Report, which is a well-prepared HIA, concluded that the proposal:

- *will not result in direct impacts the cultural heritage value or interest or heritage attributes of any adjacent protected heritage properties, nor the cultural heritage value or interest of the Collingwood Downtown HCD.*
- *will result in a minor, indirect impact through partial obstruction of views within the HCD. Views of the Collingwood Terminal Grain Elevators from the protected heritage properties on Ste Marie Street and St. Paul Street, particularly from the Collingwood Museum at 45 St Paul Street, will be partially obstructed.*

However, the Shipyards Special Policy Area approved by Council recognizes that future development will result in view obstruction impacts and will be not caused by the proposed development specifically.

The overall effect is predicted to be minor since the new construction will not exceed the property's current zoning allowance, nor the minor impacts approved as part of the Shipyards Special Policy Area and the proposal meets the Town's guidance that designs for new development be of "high quality" and contrast with the built form in the adjacent CDHCD.

the proposed development will not obstruct views along the former rail line east of the Collingwood Museum and north along Heritage Drive, nor the view along St. Paul to the dry dock.

Golder recommended that Streetcar consider adding features that commemorate Collingwood's shipbuilding heritage and ensure the historic "story" of the waterfront is maintained. In response Streetcar has committed to incorporating an interpretive tribute to the Shipyards and is exploring ways to do this within the adjacent park design. This is an ideal location for an interpretive tribute since this park has unobstructed views of the former Queen's Dry Dock.

I agree with these conclusions. During the second meeting with all parties, a robust conversation occurred about architectural resolution and some urban design aspects related to parking and sidewalks; these issues are addressed in the peer review by Cal Brook of Brook McIlroy. There was general agreement that the context of the site, and its relation to the CDHCD meant that the quality of the design and its execution, from basic massing to retail signage, were of concern to both the Town and to the applicant.

The Golder report also notes,

Although not within the CDHCD, the property is at the Huron Street "gateway" to the CDHCD as well as adjacent to protected heritage properties designated under Part V of the OHA. Therefore, development on the property must consider Section 2.6.3 of the PPS 2020 and be compatible with the heritage attributes of the CDHCD.

Compatibility implies a harmonious impact, or an impact without conflict. The HIA report underlines appropriately how the new design responds to the CDHCD design guidelines. As the site is rather isolated from the core of the CDHCD, its compliance to design guidelines needs to be seen more in light of this

specific location, as a point of entry into the harbour area, and that notion is reflected in Golder's response.

One consideration was brought up through the discussion with staff which is of significance. This site includes a small triangle of land which is not adjacent to the CDHCD, but is actually included within the CDHCD boundary. This appears to have arisen as a technical error when the land ownership was transferred, but suggests that this portion of land is of interest and should be considered in that light.

In the second meeting, it was recommended both from a heritage and urban design perspective that more public space be created at this location to allow a stronger visual connection to the Collingwood Terminals Grain Elevator and the rest of the CDHCD, and potentially that some interpretative material be considered. These suggestions would be consistent with Golder's original recommendations and would strengthen the potential of the site to contribute to the heritage narrative of Collingwood.

In making these comments I would add that further resolution is required for this triangle of land, and that the applicant's commitment to an 'interpretive tribute to the Shipyards' should be further developed and approved as a condition of the general approvals for this project.

I trust that the information contained herein is satisfactory at this time. Please do not hesitate to contact me should you require any further details or wish to discuss the contents of this letter.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Michael McClelland', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Michael McClelland, Principal
E.R.A. Architects Inc.